

# Summary of Public Comment



Roadless Area Conservation Proposed Rule and DEIS  
2000

---

Prepared by:



USDA Forest Service  
Content Analysis Enterprise Team  
(801) 517-1020

October 6, 2000

*The policy of the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, color, national origin, age, religion, sex, disability, familial status, or political affiliation. Persons believing they have been discriminated against in any Forest Service related activity should write to: Chief, Forest Service, USDA, P.O. Box 96090, Washington, DC 20090-6090*

# Table of Contents

<b>Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>vii</b>
<b>Chapter 1 Purpose and Need.....</b>	<b>1-1</b>
1.1 General Reasons For and Against Adoption of a Roadless Area Conservation Rule. ....	1-1
1.1.1 Why the Forest Service Should Adopt a Roadless Area Conservation Rule.....	1-1
1.1.1.1 Access Considerations .....	1-10
1.1.2 Why the Forest Service Should Not Adopt a Roadless Area Conservation Rule....	1-11
1.1.2.1 Access Considerations .....	1-17
1.2 The Mission and Guiding Policy of the Forest Service .....	1-20
1.2.1 Clarification of the Forest Service Mission .....	1-20
1.2.2 National Forest System Lands Management and Environmental Protection .....	1-22
1.2.3 Multiple Use Management.....	1-26
1.2.3.1 Commodity Values and Multiple Use Management.....	1-28
1.2.3.2 Non-Commodity Resources and Multiple Use Management .....	1-32
<b>Chapter 2 Consultation, Coordination, and Public Involvement.....</b>	<b>2-1</b>
2.1 Coordination and Cooperation.....	2-1
2.1.1 Coordination with Government Entities .....	2-2
2.1.2. Tribal Consultations.....	2-5
2.2 Rulemaking Process.....	2-5
2.2.1 Authority .....	2-9
2.2.2 Role of the Forest Service.....	2-12
2.2.3 Role of States and Counties .....	2-15
2.2.4 Role of Citizens.....	2-16
2.2.5 Role of Special Interest Groups .....	2-19
2.2.6 Local versus National Decision-making.....	2-22
2.3 Issues of Trust and Integrity .....	2-29
2.3.1 Misleading Information or Non-Disclosure.....	2-33
2.3.2. Use of Best Science and Assumptions.....	2-37
2.4. Public Involvement Processes.....	2-44
2.4.1 Public Meetings .....	2-46
2.4.2 Comment Period .....	2-50
2.4.3 Public Input.....	2-53
2.4.4 Analysis of Public Comment .....	2-57

**Chapter 3 Legal Issues and Concerns ..... 3-1**

3.1 General Legal Issues ..... 3-1

    3.1.1 U.S. Constitutional Law ..... 3-1

    3.1.2 Federal laws ..... 3-5

        3.1.2.1 Economic Acts ..... 3-12

    3.1.3 Executive Orders ..... 3-18

    3.1.4 State and Local Laws ..... 3-21

    3.1.5 Litigation Rulings ..... 3-24

3.2 Federal Environmental Acts/Laws ..... 3-25

    3.2.1 National Environmental Policy Act ..... 3-25

    3.2.2 Endangered Species Act ..... 3-42

    3.2.3 Other ..... 3-42

3.3 Federal Land Management Acts/Laws ..... 3-43

    3.3.1 Federal Land Policy Management Act ..... 3-43

    3.3.2 Multiple-Use and Organic Acts ..... 3-45

    3.3.3 National Forest Management Act and Renewable Resources Planning Act ..... 3-47

    3.3.4 Wilderness Acts ..... 3-56

    3.3.5 Revised Statute 2477 ..... 3-61

    3.3.6 Alaska Concerns ..... 3-64

    3.3.7 Other Acts ..... 3-69

    3.3.8 Establish Review Panels ..... 3-72

3.4 Mining Acts ..... 3-72

    3.4.1 1872 Mining Law ..... 3-72

    3.4.2 Other Mining and Mineral Leasing Laws ..... 3-74

    3.4.3 Mining Access ..... 3-77

    3.4.4 Consistency Between the Proposed Rule and Existing Laws ..... 3-82

3.5 Proposed Legislation/Acts ..... 3-86

3.6 Treaties/Tribal Laws ..... 3-88

**Chapter 4 Alternatives and Rule Development ..... 4-1**

4.1 Development of Alternatives ..... 4-1

4.2 Range of Alternatives ..... 4-3

4.3 New Alternatives ..... 4-5

4.4 Prohibition Alternatives ..... 4-7

    4.4.1 Alternative 1 ..... 4-9

    4.4.2 Alternative 2 ..... 4-10

    4.4.3 Alternative 3 ..... 4-12

    4.4.4 Alternative 4 ..... 4-14

4.5 Procedural Alternatives ..... 4-16

    4.5.1 Alternative A ..... 4-18

    4.5.2 Alternative B ..... 4-19

    4.5.3 Alternative C ..... 4-19

    4.5.4 Alternative D ..... 4-20

---

4.6 Tongass Alternatives.....	4-20
4.6.1 Alternative T1 .....	4-23
4.6.2. Alternative T2 .....	4-24
4.6.3 Alternative T3 .....	4-24
4.6.4 Alternative T4 .....	4-24
4.7 Alternatives Considered but Eliminated .....	4-26
4.8 Additional Areas to be Included in the Proposed Rule.....	4-27
4.8.1 Size Limitations on Roadless Areas .....	4-30
4.9 Exemptions .....	4-34
4.10 Proposed Rule Development.....	4-34
4.10.1 Adequacy of Inventories and Analysis .....	4-40
4.10.1.1 RARE I and RARE II .....	4-42
4.10.1.2 Roadless Area Inventory Criteria.....	4-43
4.10.1.3 Further Analysis.....	4-47
4.10.2 Road Classifications.....	4-48
4.10.3 Wilderness and National Monument Designations.....	4-53

## **Chapter 5 Environmental Effects ..... 5-1**

5.1 General Environment.....	5-1
5.1.1 Pollution.....	5-5
5.1.2 Environmental Preservation.....	5-7
5.1.3 Effects of Other Activities on the Environment .....	5-8
5.1.4 Adequacy of Environmental Analysis .....	5-9
5.2 Forest Health.....	5-15
5.2.1 Adequacy of the Forest Health Analysis .....	5-17
5.3 Weeds, Insects, and Disease .....	5-17
5.3.1 Effects of Other Activities on Weeds, Insects, and Disease.....	5-18
5.3.2 Adequacy of Analysis of Weeds, Insects, and Disease .....	5-20
5.4 Fire.....	5-21
5.4.1 Effects of Other Activities on Fire.....	5-22
5.4.2 Adequacy of Analysis of Fire .....	5-22
5.5 Biodiversity.....	5-23
5.5.1 Effects of Other Activities on Biodiversity .....	5-25
5.6 Vegetation .....	5-26
5.6.1 Effects of Other Activities on Vegetation.....	5-27
5.7 Wildlife .....	5-27
5.7.1 Species of Public Concern .....	5-30
5.7.2 Effects of Other Activities on Wildlife.....	5-32
5.7.3 Adequacy of Analysis of Wildlife .....	5-36
5.8 Habitat.....	5-38
5.8.1 Effects of Other Activities on Habitat .....	5-39
5.8.2 Adequacy of Analysis of Habitat.....	5-40
5.9 Connectivity and Fragmentation.....	5-41
5.9.1 Effects of Other Activities on Connectivity.....	5-43

---

5.9.2 Adequacy of Analysis of Connectivity ..... 5-43

5.10 Aquatic Wildlife..... 5-45

5.10.1 Effects of Other Activities on Aquatic Wildlife ..... 5-47

5.11 Threatened and Endangered Species ..... 5-48

5.11.1 Adequacy of Analysis of Threatened and Endangered Species..... 5-50

5.12 Watersheds..... 5-51

5.12.1 Effects of Other Activities on Watersheds and Water Resources..... 5-53

5.12.2 Adequacy of Analysis of Watersheds and Water Resources ..... 5-56

5.13 Soils..... 5-59

5.13.1 Effects of Other Activities on Soils ..... 5-60

5.13.2 Adequacy of Analysis of Soils..... 5-61

5.14 Air Quality ..... 5-63

5.14.1 Effects of Other Activities on Air Quality ..... 5-64

5.14.2 Adequacy of Analysis of Air Quality ..... 5-65

5.15 Global Effects ..... 5-67

**Chapter 6 Human Uses and National Forest System Land Management ..... 6-1**

6.1 General Management Considerations ..... 6-1

6.2 Travelway Infrastructure Management..... 6-6

6.2.1 General Management Direction..... 6-6

6.2.2 Road Construction, Reconstruction, and Maintenance..... 6-10

6.2.3 Exceptions to the Road Building Prohibition ..... 6-20

6.2.4 Road Decommissioning and Removal..... 6-23

6.2.5 Trail System Management ..... 6-29

6.2.6 Ways ..... 6-32

6.3 Commodity, Extractive, and Commercial Activities ..... 6-34

6.3.1 Timber Harvest, Commercial..... 6-34

6.3.2 Silvicultural Methods..... 6-44

6.3.3 Adequacy of Analysis ..... 6-48

6.3.4 Timber Harvest, Stewardship, and Forest Health ..... 6-52

6.3.5 Fuel Reduction and Fire Management ..... 6-63

6.3.6 Grazing..... 6-70

6.3.7 Locatable and Leasable Minerals..... 6-73

6.3.8 Alternative Resources and Energy Sources ..... 6-87

6.3.9 Utility and Water Delivery System Permits and Infrastructure ..... 6-89

6.3.10 Ski Area Permits ..... 6-93

6.4 Wildlife-Dependent Activities..... 6-101

6.5 Non-Timber Forest Products..... 6-106

6.6 Cultural and Heritage Resources ..... 6-107

6.7 Recreation and Travel Management ..... 6-111

6.7.1 General Management ..... 6-111

6.7.2 Access to Existing Roads and Trails..... 6-117

6.7.3 Motorized Recreation..... 6-122

---

6.7.3.1 Motorized/Off-Highway Vehicle Recreation on Forest Lands.....	6-124
6.7.3.2 Motorized/Off-Highway Vehicle Recreation in Roadless Areas.....	6-127
6.7.3.3 Limitations on Motorized/Off-Highway Vehicle Recreation .....	6-130
6.7.3.4 Maintenance of Motorized/Off-Highway Vehicle Recreation Trails and Areas	6-135
6.7.4 Non-motorized Activities.....	6-136
6.7.5 Recreation Capacity, User Conflicts, and Relative Effects of Activities .....	6-140
6.7.6 Public Education, Monitoring, and Enforcement .....	6-149
6.8 Land Ownership.....	6-155
6.8.1 Urban/Forest Interface .....	6-155
6.8.2 Inholdings .....	6-157
6.8.3 Land Exchanges and Acquisitions .....	6-161
6.8.4 Transfer of Effects to Private and Other Public Lands .....	6-163

## **Chapter 7 Social and Economic Considerations ..... 7-1**

7.1 Social Effects .....	7-1
7.1.1 Social Value of Non-Commodity Resources .....	7-1
7.1.2 Community and Family Values and Social Justice.....	7-6
7.1.3 Aesthetic and Scenic Values .....	7-9
7.1.4 Bequest Value to Future Generations .....	7-11
7.2 Economic Effects .....	7-13
7.2.1 General Economic Effects .....	7-13
7.2.2 Economic Effects on Forest Resource Dependent Businesses, Small Businesses, and Communities .....	7-20
7.2.2.1 Jobs and Employment .....	7-28
7.2.2.2 Economic Impacts and the Tongass National Forest.....	7-35
7.2.3 Local Tax Base, Payments in Lieu of Taxes (PILT) and 25% Funds.....	7-39
7.2.4 Grazing Permits and Fees .....	7-42
7.2.5 Minerals, Oil and Gas .....	7-43
7.2.6 Agency Costs, Financial Responsibilities, and Funding General .....	7-49
7.2.6.1 Fire Control and Fuels Management Costs.....	7-55
7.2.6.2 Agency Costs and the Timber Industry .....	7-57
7.2.6.3 Subsidies .....	7-61
7.2.6.4 Cost of Roadless Area Conservation Proposed Rule.....	7-63
7.2.6.5 Funding for Monitoring and Enforcement of Regulations .....	7-65
7.2.6.6 Cost and Funding of Forest Travelway Infrastructure Management .....	7-66
7.2.6.7 User Fees and Costs for Recreational Opportunities .....	7-71

## **Chapter 8 Cumulative Effects Analysis ..... 8-1**

8.1 Relationship to Other Forest Service Planning Processes and Proposed Rules.....	8-1
8.2 Cumulative Effects.....	8-9
8.2.1 Cumulative Effects with Policies, Plans, and Programs .....	8-9
8.2.2 Adequacy of the Cumulative Effects Analysis in the Draft EIS.....	8-12

---

<b>Chapter 9 Technical and Editorial Concerns.....</b>	<b>9-1</b>
9.1 General Comments.....	9-1
9.2 Clarity of Terminology .....	9-2
9.3 Contradictory Concepts .....	9-3
9.4 Identification of Specific Terms and Concepts.....	9-6
9.5 Requested Changes .....	9-7
9.6 Definitions.....	9-13
9.6.1 Road Definitions and Classifications.....	9-13
9.6.2 Miscellaneous Definitions .....	9-22
9.6.3 Additional Definitions .....	9-26
9.7 Adequacy of Maps, Tables, Figures, and Appendices.....	9-27
<b>Appendix A Glossary of Acronyms.....</b>	<b>A-1</b>
<b>Appendix B Requests for Inclusion or Exemption of Specific Areas</b> <b>.....</b>	<b>B-1</b>
<b>Appendix C Index of Public Concerns.....</b>	<b>C-1</b>
<b>Appendix D Content Analysis Process.....</b>	<b>D-1</b>
<b>Appendix E Coding Structure.....</b>	<b>E-1</b>
<b>Appendix F Demographics .....</b>	<b>F-1</b>

---