African Americans' Emotional Responses to Images of Traffic Stops

D'Andra Orey Jackson State University byron.d.orey@jsums.edu

Frank R. Baumgartner University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill Frankb@unc.edu

Background

The recent deaths of unarmed blacks at the hand of white police officers have sparked protests across the nation. Based on media images of these protests, protesters were visibly angered by these shootings, and understandably so. We conceptualize these events as racially traumatic stressful events (RTSEs) and argue that exposure to RTSEs results in negative psychophysiological responses. We further explore whether the simple exposure to a photo of a police officer conducting a traffic stop may have effects similar to an RTSE.

Prior research has associated trauma with racial discrimination and racism. Carter (2006), for example, has used the term race-based traumatic stress (RBTS) in associating trauma with racism. Similarly, Smith (2011) argues that the accumulation of exposure to racism and discrimination can lead to what he has termed racial battle fatigue. These effects should of course be stronger among racial minorities than among whites, who are less likely to experience RTSEs. Also, some police interactions are more stressful than others; a routine traffic stop may be stressful, but a pretextual and potentially racially motivated event is more so to a minority citizen. According to Epp and colleagues (2014), drivers can tell the difference between a legitimate, well justified traffic stop (for example, being caught while driving much faster than the speed limit) and one with a flimsy legal justification. For minority drivers, repeated such incidents can give rise to a feeling of second-class citizenship, unfairness, and frustration with the police. In a recent study, Elizabeth Maltby (2017) shows dramatic declines in feelings of trust in government, voting, and other indicators of democratic and community engagement among educated blacks living in areas with higher criminal justice system intrusions. Scholars including Meares (2009), Burch (2013), Lerman and Weaver (2014), Tyler and colleagues (2014), and Glaser (2015) have addressed various troubling aspects of legitimacy, perception, and democratic inclusiveness inherent in the interactions between police and the public, in particular those members of the public most likely to come into involuntary contact with the police: young men of color.

There are many reasons to believe that interactions with the police might be experienced differently by members of the public with different demographic characteristics. We focus on physiological responses to photographs depicting police-citizen interactions, comparing these with standard images from the psychological literature on threat. We analyze galvanic skin levels (GSL), or skin conductance, a standard measure in the field. Given the saliency of negative relationships between police officers and blacks, we expect that the mere presence of police officers may generate higher GSL among blacks. Our focus here is therefore on psychophysiological responses to one specific type of police interaction: traffic stops. And we argue that differences in psychophysiological responses are of real consequence politically – they matter not just to real-world reactions to policing, but to citizens' policy preferences and political support. They may also have under-appreciated public health consequences. If even a routine traffic stop induces significant stress among minority drivers, we should question whether such things as police stops and questionings are merely "momentary inconveniences" as the courts have considered, or if they have greater negative consequence.

We use a lab-experimental research design to examine reactions to traffic stops among two samples, one collected from a mixture of faculty, staff and students at a predominantly black university. Subjects were also recruited from the city at-large using a snow ball sampling technique. A priori, we expect blacks who possess high levels of racial identity to be aroused when exposed to stimuli of police conducting traffic stops when compared to blacks with low levels of racial identity. Our thinking is that because of blacks' shared experiences and their

belief that what happens to other blacks will affect their own life (Dawson 1993), blacks will empathize with blacks who have been shot by police and thus be threatened when they see images of the police.

In recent years, the political science literature has relied almost exclusively on one variable, linked fate, to measure racial identity. Given that this variable is measured using only one question, the research here borrows from psychology to employ multiple dimensions of racial identity. In addition to racial identity, the research here also employs variables to tap blacks' disillusionment as it relates to the American dream. Those blacks who possess high levels of legal disillusionment are not expected to be aroused when they see images of police because they have become immune to a failed legal system. We do not, however, have any a priori expectations regarding a relationship between those blacks who believe that the economic system has failed poor people and physiological responses to traffic stop images, as the item used to operationalize the economic disillusionment variable is not race-specific. Closing out our expectations related to intra-racial attitudes, we do not expect blacks who resent other blacks to be aroused by police images because they may subscribe to conservative views such as the police upholding law and order and the belief that blacks who are killed by police are killed because of their own wrongdoings. Lastly, we investigate blacks' physiological responses to traffic stop images as a function of attitudes toward the police. We argue that blacks who have experienced violent encounters with police will be aroused when they see images of police making traffic stops. Likewise, we expect blacks who mention that police brutality or the lack of social justice makes them angry to be aroused when they witness police making traffic stops.

We outline the related literatures briefly below, before turning to a description of our experimental design. We then review preliminary results and interpret them in light of the current context in the United States.

Blacks' Responses to Racially Traumatic Stressful Events (RTSEs)

One does not have to be physically present to be impacted by a traumatic event. For example, people who were indirectly exposed via the media or who personally witnessed events such as 9/11 or the Boston Marathon bombings have been found to have been psychologically affected. Holman, Garfin and Silver (2014) administered acute stress inventories to test the relationship between stress and both the direct and indirect consumption of media-based exposure to the Boston bombings and exposure to prior traumatic events such as 9/11 and the Sandy Hook Elementary School shootings. The findings reveal that prior media exposure to traumatic events are significantly correlated with increased levels of acute stress.

Research has also found a relationship between witnesses of violent crimes and elevated levels of psychological disorders including, but, not limited to posttraumatic stress disorder, depression and anxiety (Singer, Anglin, Song and Lunghofer 1995). Such exposure has also been found to be linked to violent antisocial behavior (Gorman, Huesmann and Spindler 2003) and substance abuse (Farrell and Bruce 1997).

More specific to the research here, another body of literature has associated trauma with racial discrimination and racism. Smith, et al. (2011) argues that the accumulation of exposure to racism and discrimination can lead to what he has termed racial battle fatigue. He compares racism and discrimination to the constant pressure faced by soldiers on the battlefield. Along these lines, Williams (2015), relying on the Diagnostic Manual of Mental Disorders 5 (DSM-5) associates racial trauma with symptoms associated with post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD). She writes "PTSD develops after a terrifying ordeal that involved physical harm or the threat of

physical harm. The person who develops PTSD may have been the one who was harmed, the harm may have happened to a loved one, or the person may have witnessed a harmful event that happened to loved ones or strangers" (Williams 2015)

For many blacks, simple images of police officers might trigger such anger. Indeed, blacks have been observed on many occasions expressing anger in the aftermath of events associated with police officers. From the verdict in the Rodney King case to the aftermath of the Ferguson, Missouri case, anger has been at the root of the uprisings that occurred among large segments of the black population.

In addition to the psychological measures, a wide body of literature has found a relationship between laboratory analogues of perceived discrimination and physiological activity (Soto Dawson-Andoh and BeLue 2011; Lincoln, Chatters, Taylor and Jackson 2007). Neblett and Roberts (2013), however, expand this literature by examining the role of racial identity as a mitigating factor in explaining the impact on physiological activity. These authors employ audio vignettes of racist comments made by black and white police officers as stimuli to examine the impact of perceived discrimination on the autonomic nervous system. Unlike prior work, they include physiological responses that reflect reactions driven by both the parasympathetic and sympathetic nervous systems. Their findings are mixed. They find that those blacks with high racial identities who were exposed to racist comments by white police officers were better able to cope when compared to those with low identities. The opposite, however, occurred when the perpetrator was a black police officer. That is, blacks with high racial identities experienced physiological responses that were reflective of them perceiving police officers to pose a threat.

A recent study analyzing transcripts from officer body cameras from traffic stops in Oakland California documented, in fact, that officers are more respectful when dealing with white drivers and less so when interacting with blacks (see Voigt et al. 2017). If officers behave differently systematically when dealing with individuals of different racial groups, it stands to reason that members of those groups would have different expectations when they know they are going to be approached by an officer.

We seek to build on the extant literature by examining the impact of intra-racial attitudes on blacks' physiological responses when they observe police making traffic stops. We regard this work as exploratory, in part because the existing literature points in different directions. Where the literature on anger is concerned, for many blacks, simple images of police officers might trigger anger. From the verdict in the Rodney King case to the aftermath of the Ferguson, Missouri case, anger has been at the root of the uprisings that occurred among large segments of the black population. Insofar as GSL reflects anger (and it may or may not), we might expect comparatively high GSL among blacks in reaction to police photos. At the same time, work on PTSD suggests that blacks may exhibit comparatively low GSL in reaction to traffic stop photos – prior negative experience with policy might serve to dampen physiological responses.

The Contours and Dimensions of Black Ideologies

Given the findings of Neblett and Roberts (2013), we turn our attention to the political science research on intra-racial differences among blacks. Traditionally, the political science literature has measured African-American group identification using items asking about feelings of closeness toward blacks (Tate 1993). Variables used to measure racial identification, as a construct, have taken on almost as many labels as there are researchers on the topic. These labels include: linked or common fate (Tate 1993 and Dawson 1994), black consciousness (Gurin and Epps 1975; Miller, Gurin, Gurin and Malanchuk 1981; Gurin, Miller and Gurin 1980; Gurin, Hatchett and Jackson 1989; Shingles 1981; Reese and Brown 1995), and black nationalism/black

autonomy/racial solidarity (Welch et al 2002; Brown and Shaw 2002; Davis and Brown 2002; Dawson 2001). The common denominator between all of these labels is the shared experiences and worldview possessed by blacks. In recent years, Linked Fate has been used the most to conceptualize racial identity.

In our research, we turn to the psychology literature to test the validity of competing variables used to explore racial identity. Specifically, we employ the Multidimensional Inventory of Black Identity-Short Form (MIBI-S; Martin, Wout, Nguyen, Gonzalez, & Sellers, 2010). The items used in this inventory are used to create four categories of racial identity. Here we focus on only three of those categories: Racial Regard, Racial Centrality, and Ideology. Racial regard is measured using two variables. Private regard is how people feel towards African Americans or being an African American themselves. Public regard is how people feel that others view African Americans. Here, we only use public regard. Racial Centrality is the degree to which African Americans identify themselves with their race when compared to competing identities (e.g., gender, class...). This dimension is hierarchical and illustrates whether individuals implicitly rank their racial identity higher than other identities in their self-identification. Ideology includes individual's beliefs, opinions, and attitudes related to how the racial groups should behave, live and interact with society. The general model includes four ideological philosophies. Here we focus on two of the subcategories: the nationalist and the assimilationist ideology. The nationalist ideology emphasizes that the African-American experience is unique when compared to other groups. Additionally, such African Americans believe that they should control their own life and participate in African American organizations in pursuing social changes. The assimilationist ideology focuses on individuals' belief that African Americans should work within the system. It should be noted that this does not necessarily result in the deemphasis of the importance of being black nor that racism does not persist.

Save for the work of Allen, Dawson and Brown (1989) and Dawson (2001 and 2004), research on black political attitudes has focused almost exclusively on racial solidarity within the black community. Additionally, much of the research on racial attitudes has focused solely on white racist attitudes toward blacks. The work of Cohen (1999) proves instructive here. Cohen's work is appropriate because it moves beyond the dominant paradigm of studying race relations as a function of the dominant group's regulation of the marginal group to a discussion of the marginal group's regulation of their own group members (e.g., blacks vs. blacks). Cohen (1999) states that white stereotypes of blacks "have great staying power" (43). The argument there is that blacks are socialized by the same media as other racial groups, and are also likely to embrace negative stereotypes of blacks. Indeed, scholars from other disciplines have long argued and provided empirical support for this position (see e.g., Jost and Banaji 1994). Prior research by Orey and his colleagues addresses this issue by using the literature's current explanations of white racism and resentment toward blacks to measure internalized racism and intra-racial resentment among blacks. Internalized racism is operationalized based on survey items that measure the differences of blacks' negative stereotypes of other blacks (e.g., lazy and unintelligent) when compared to whites. Intra-group resentment is operationalized using items designed to measure white racial resentment, that is, the notion that blacks fail to subscribe to the American ethos of individualism and other traditional values in tandem with an anti-black affection (e.g., Kinder and Sanders 1996). Orey and his colleagues test the validity of

_

¹ To be sure, Black Consciousness is not conceptually isomorphic with racial identity. It does, however, include racial identity as a sub category.

internalized racism and intra-racial resentment, when applied to blacks, and find that blacks who possess these attitudes tend to oppose progressive policies such as affirmative action, reparations, and welfare (Orey, King, Titani-Smith and Ricks 2012; Orey, Craemer and Price 2013; Orey, King, Lawrence and Anderson 2012).

Disillusionment and Black Rage

Now, after a long-enduring faith and patience, without parallel, I think, in human history, the black citizen has lost his patience—and his fear—and is, I am afraid, also losing his faith in the American establishment and system insofar as their promises to him are concerned. He is demanding, not appealing, nowadays, and his demands begin to take unexpected courses—courses which could only be born out of profound frustration and complete disillusionment (Ralph J. Bunche, as cited in Dawson 2001, 273).

Media coverage of police violence toward blacks powerfully reinforces prior incidents that have triggered criticisms of America by blacks. Indeed, during the final weeks of the Democratic presidential primaries in 2008, then presidential candidate Barack Obama endured heavy criticism from the media based on comments made by his former pastor, Reverend Dr. Jeremiah Wright. This flap emerged shortly after incendiary comments were released by the media concerning Dr. Wright's criticism of the American government as being the culprit/root of the poor life-chances faced by many blacks. Specifically, he stated, "[t]he government gives them the drugs, builds bigger prisons, passes a three strikes law, and then wants us (African Americans) to sing 'God Bless America.' No, no, no; not 'God Bless America,' God damn America... for killing innocent people; God damn America for treating its citizens as less than human..." These inflammatory remarks, although clearly much more extreme, are consistent with Ralph Bunche's epigraph above. In each case, a clear sense of frustration is key. Both Bunche and Wright allude to America's failure to live up to its own principles of equality. Such sentiments capture what Dawson (2001) has conceptualized as a disillusioned-liberal ideology the belief that America has failed to fulfill its promise of equality. This disillusionment is rooted in the many observations of racial inequalities witnessed by blacks on a daily basis. Such observations arguably produce a frustration, whereby blacks either blame blacks for their failure, or they blame the system. The current research examines blacks' response to police killings by employing experimental research designs. In addition to the psychological impact that these events might have on blacks, it is also possible that these RTSE's can trigger negative physiological responses. These negative reactions can serve as an antecedent to negative political attitudes and behavior.

In addition to Dawson's (2001) finding that disillusioned liberalism serves as one of the contours and dimensions of black ideology, specifically noting that blacks are disillusioned with racial progress in America, Hochschild (1995) criticizes various tenets of the American Dream as possibly being out of reach for the average American. Her criticism is based on the fact that the American Dream places focus on individualism and competition, thereby resulting in a false sense of hope. Hochschild's point is crucial to understanding one of the key arguments in this paper. That is, despite the pessimistic tone expressed during the course of her argument, it is this sense of hope that affords the disillusioned liberal to continue embracing America. Empirically, the work of Dawson (2001) proves to be the most rigorous effort at measuring and testing disillusionment among blacks. Using the concept disillusioned liberalism, Dawson reports that over 75 percent of blacks believe that they live in a country that is "racially unjust" (2001, 280; see also Block 2010).

While African Americans may be disillusioned in many regards, there are those who identify strongly with being an American. Like most Americans, African Americans are expected to rally around the flag during times of war, African Americans are no exceptions.

Expectations and Hypotheses

No driver wants to be pulled over for speeding, and no one can be expected to enjoy a traffic stop, much less are more aggressive encounter with the police such as a k-9 unit or an armed officer with gun pointing. Our baseline expectation is thus that reactions to photos of traffic stops will elicit heightened GSL, *ceteris paribus*.

We nevertheless anticipate a good degree of heterogeneity in responses to traffic stop photos. Recall that the literature points to different possibilities: blacks may feel anger, and exhibit higher GSL; or they may already be so sensitized that there will be little to no reaction in GSL. Here, we expect heterogeneity among blacks based on a number of psychological characteristics. We expect the responses yielded by African Americans responses to police to vary depending on the dimension of racial identity and ideology that is being measured. We expected a positive relationship among African Americans who possess high levels of linked fate, Black Nationalism, Disillusionment, those who believe that the police went too far in Ferguson, younger respondents and those who live in the St. Louis Ferguson area. Secondly, we expect negative responses to occur among those who possess high levels of American Identity, Public Regard, and Assimilationist Ideology.

Experiment

Galvanic skin levels are among the most straightforward, and most used, physiological measures of activation, or arousal. There is a growing body of work across the social sciences using GSL; most pertinent to this work are the literatures using GSL to capture reactions to political media stimuli (e.g., Grabe and Kamhawi 2006; Grabe et al. 2000; Soroka and McAdams 2015; Soroka, Gidengil, Fournier and Nir 2016) and to explore links between physiology and political ideology (e.g., Dodd et al. 2012; Hibbing, Smith, and Alford 2014; Oxley et al. 2008; Smith et al. 2011). GSL is measured using sensors attached to two fingers, which send and receive very weak electrical impulses. The rate of conductance captures the constantly varying amount of liquid (i.e., sweat) in respondents' hands. Variations in moisture (and thus conductance) are regulated by the sympathetic nervous system, and are an indication of arousal (negative or positive).

The advantage of using IAPS photos is that they provide a baseline for psychophysiological reactions. There is a large body of work that relies on IAPS stimuli, including recent work on psychophysiology and politics (including the political ideology literature, cited above). We know from past work that participants tend to show low activation for positive and neutral photos, and high activation for threat photos. Our analysis here is focused on activation in response to traffic stop photos, in comparison with these three IAPS categories.

Traffic stop photos were selected by the authors based on a Google search of actual traffic stop photos, and with an eye on capturing traffic stops which are (a) point-of-view, so that respondents can picture themselves in that situation, and so that the race of the person being stopped is not visible, and (b) varying in the nature of the traffic stop, i.e., inside and outside the car, or including and not including dogs and guns. We also hold the race of the police officer constant, so that every case involves white officers. The race of the officer is no doubt of interest

– reactions to white officers may well differ from reactions to black officers. Our aim here is to not have too many moving parts, however; and so we view race of officer as an important manipulation in future work. Traffic stop photos used in the experiment are included in Appendix Figure 1. IAPS photos cannot be distributed, but are readily available to researchers from the Center for the Study of Emotion and Attention at the University of Florida. For the sake of clarity, however, note that our IAPS photos include the following: *Positive*: dog, baby, flowers, waterfall, ice cream cone; *Neutral*: mushrooms, basket, iron, dustpan, fork; *Threat*: street scene with shooting soldiers, man with gun in his mouth, masked man with knife, attacking dog, attacking snake.

The experiment itself is straightforward. Following a one-minute gray screen, each participant is exposed to twenty randomly-ordered photos. Each photo was shown once and was preceded by a fixation point that was displayed during an inter-stimulus interval. The images were separated by 10-second gray screens, known as interval stimulus intervals (ISI). The ISI serves as a baseline for comparison to the stimuli – we are focused on the change in GSL from ISI to stimulus, for each stimulus, comparing across our four categories: positive, neutral, threat, and traffic stops. We conducted the experiment in a quiet laboratory setting at Jackson State University over the summer of 2017.

The data are derived from an all-black convenience sample consisting of a mixture of members from the local community and faculty, staff and students at a predominantly black university located in the Deep-South. The experiment was conducted at a laboratory located on a University campus. Prior to arriving at the lab, subjects were asked to complete a survey and an Implicit Association Test. The total number of subjects included in the analysis is 55.² The sample consists of roughly 26.9 percent of individuals who possessed less than a high school diploma, 16 percent of participants earned a High School diploma, roughly 22.3 percent completed some level of college and 34.8 percent had earned a college degree or more. Roughly 65 percent of the participants were males, compared to 35 percent females. The ages range from 16 to 65, with a mean age of roughly 31. We make no claim that the sample employed in our analysis is representative of the country, state, city or campus from which it was drawn. We can claim, however, that the sample does not consist entirely of undergraduates.

The study was approved by the Institutional Review Board at Jackson State University and all subjects gave written informed consent prior to participation in the study. Prior to arriving at the lab, subjects were asked to complete an online survey and were given directions and a time and date to complete the experiment. Once they arrived, a proctor explained to them the process related to the physiological experiment. They were instructed that two small sensors would be attached to the tips of the middle phalanx of the index and middle fingers to measure their sweat levels. Following the instructions, the proctor applied an isotonic, 0.05 molar NaCl, electrode paste to two Ag/AgCl electrodes to the subject. These electrodes were connected to leads that ran from a BioPac M150 for data acquisition and the GSR/EDA100C device which measures skin conductance via changes in perspiration on the surface of the skin due to stress, arousal or emotional excitement. The BioPac M150 data acquisition unit, when attached to the EDA 100c amplifier, allows for the analysis of galvanic skin activity focusing specifically on skin conductance levels, which captures the increased conductivity resulting from moisture secreted by eccrine glands in the lower layers of the skin.

7

² Missing data in the regression models are associated with problems related to the GSR scores e.g., outliers.

Once the subjects were prepared for the study, they were instructed to relax while the proctor prepared the experiment. The preparation time took about five minutes to allow the subjects to calm down from any potential anxieties that may have existed from being connected to the electrodes or any other factors that may alter the results and to allow the gel to penetrate the skin. Next, the subject was asked to read the consent form and to give an oral response indicating that they agreed to proceed with the study. They were also informed that they could discontinue the study at any time.

The *dependent variables* are measured based on the difference between the means of the stimuli and the inter-stimulus interval (ISI). The experiment consists of five different stimuli for each of the categories (i.e., Traffic Stops, Threat, positive and neutral). For example, for the Traffic Stops category, five pictures were randomly shown to each subject. From these five categories, a total of five difference-of-means scores were derived. When assessing each subject, the highest score among the five scores was selected to be included as the dependent variable. In determining whether police images impact blacks, we compare the results from two models; one examining Traffic Stops and the other one explaining blacks' responses to Threatening images.

Acqknowledge software was used to conduct the analyses. Using raw scores produced by the ISI and stimuli proves to be problematic when using skin conductance analyses due to the wide variance that exists across subjects. For example, some subjects may be prone to sweat more than others. Indeed, black subjects have been found to sweat less when compared to other racial groups (Boucsein et al. 2012). Because of this, the physiological measure used here is not the absolute skin conductance levels computed upon the presentation of the stimuli, but, rather it is the first difference between the ISI and the stimulus. Thus, the data are analyzed by taking the difference between the skin conductance levels (SCL) for the ISI (baseline) and the skin conductance of the stimuli (Stimulus-ISI). Positive numbers represented an arousal. The raw data were sampled at 2000 HZ, but, were downsampled to 62 HZ for the analysis.³

First, to analyze the data, we first log-transformed the raw Traffic Stop and Threatening GSL waveforms for each subject. The unit of analysis is in microsemiens. The first difference is used as the *dependent variable*. The independent variables include a variety of demographics and intra-racial measurements.⁴

Intra Racial Resentment is operationalized based on the following Likert-type items (strongly disagree-strongly agree): "Over the past few years blacks have gotten less than they deserve" (reverse coded); "Irish, Italians, Jewish and many other minorities overcame prejudice and worked their way up. Blacks should do the same without any special favors"; "It's really just a matter of some people not trying hard enough. If blacks would only try harder they could be just as well off as whites"; and "Generations of slavery and discrimination have created conditions that make it difficult for blacks to work their way out of the lower class" (reverse coded). An additive scale was created, resulting in a reliability score of $\alpha = .63$.

Disillusioned Liberalism is operationalized using two separate variables: Legal Disillusionment and Economic Disillusionment, each coded from disagree-strongly agree.

³ When necessary, smoothing and low pass filtering techniques were used to correct outliers that may have been associated with such issues as electrode movement.

⁴ Reliability analyses were conducted using statistics computed using SPSS v. 22. The internal properties of the variables were established through analysis of internal reliability via Cronbach alpha.

Economic Disillusionment is measured using the following Likert-item: "How strongly do you agree or disagree that the American economic system is unfair to poor people?" Likewise, Legal Disillusionment is measured based on the following Likert-item: "How strongly do you agree or disagree with the statement that the American legal system is unfair to Blacks?"

Multiple measures are employed to measure racial identity. To be sure, we employ the traditional item used in political science, Linked Fate. It is measured based on a single item: "Do you think what happens generally to black people in this country will have something to do with what happens in your life?" Borrowing from Psychology, however, we also incorporate Sellers et al.'s (1998) MMRI model to expand our measures of racial identity. Racial Centrality is measured using two items: "I feel close to other black people" and "I have a strong sense of belonging to other Black people" (Strongly Disagree-Strongly Agree). Each of these items load onto one dimension. An additive scale was created, resulting in a reliability score of $\alpha = .85$.

Public Regard is measured based on the following three items: "Most people think that Blacks are as smart as people of other races,"; "People think that Blacks are as good as people from other races; and "People from other races think that Blacks have made important contributions." These items load onto a single dimension and achieve an α score of .83.

Additionally, the variables used to measure attitudes toward the police are the frequency of Violent Encounters with Law Enforcers and Anger toward Police Violence. Anger toward Police Violence is measured using the open-ended item: "Describe any issues that make you angry about America." The responses were content analyzed and coded as a 1 if the subject noted that either police brutality or a reference to social justice made them angry. Violent Encounter with Law Enforcers was measured based on the subject's response to an item that asked whether they had "ever had a violent encounter with a law enforcement agent (for example: a police officer, a security guard...)?" This variable was coded as a zero for none; one for one; two for two; and three if the subject indicated more than two.

American Identity is measured based on a five point Likert-scale asking: "Do you agree that the world would be better if other countries were like ours?"

The controls included sex and levels of education. Male is coded as 1 and Female is coded as 0. Education consists of 9 values ranging from 9-12th grade to PhD. OLS is employed to analyze each of the models. The sample also controls for subjects geographical location. Dummy variables were created for subjects who lived in Ferguson, Mo., St. Louis, Mo., Nebraska and the second cohort of subjects who lived in Jackson, MS. The findings for the Traffic Stop model are found in Table 1 below.

Table 1. Blacks Responses to Images of Traffic Stops

1	Robust							
					[95% Conf.			
Age								
Sex Male	.0040929	.0044894	0.91	0.367	0049805	.0131662		
Education	.0003075	.0012111	0.25	0.801	0021403	.0027554		
Linked Fate	.0065639	.0023066	2.85	0.007	.001902	.0112258		
Society Unfair	0055922	.0026603	-2.10	0.042	0109688	000215		
Legal System								
Unfair	.0051211	.002489	2.06	0.046	.0000907	.0101515		
Assimilation	0019156	.0008023	-2.39	0.022	003537	0002941		
Violent								
Encounter	.00309	.0022889	1.35	0.185	0015361	.0077161		
American Id	.0059834	.0024139	2.48	0.018	.0011046	.0108622		
Police_Too Far	.011634	.0038218	3.04	0.004	.0039099	.0193581		
Centrality	0012532	.0006515	-1.92	0.062	0025699	.0000635		
Public Regard	.0021374	.0007149	2.99	0.005	.0006925	.0035823		
Black_Nation	0030268	.0013645	-2.22	0.032	0057846	000269		
Nebraska	.0055465	.0048708	1.14	0.262	0042978	.0153909		
Ferguson	0010975	.0067799	-0.16	0.872	0148001	.0126052		
St Louis	.0032821	.0169155	0.19	0.847	0309054	.0374695		
Jackson2	0028087	.0084924	-0.33	0.743	0199725	.014355		
_cons	0190592	.0168624	-1.13	0.265	0531394	.015021		

N=58 $R^2=.59$

We first turn our attention to the variables for which the coefficients were statistically significant from zero. According to the table, African Americans who possessed high levels of Linked Fate, American Identity, Legal Disillusionment, Public Regard and who believed that the police went too far in Ferguson possessed higher responses when compared to those who scored

lower on each of the scales. On the other hand, African Americans who possessed higher levels of Assimilation, Black Nationalism and those who believed that society as a whole is unfair to African Americans all responded less when compared to their counterparts. Those who had high levels of Racial Centrality scored lower, but, the coefficient was marginally significant (p \approx .062).

To assess whether images of Traffic Stops uniquely impact blacks' physiological responses, we compare the findings in Table 1 with those results in Table 2, which focuses on blacks' physiological responses to Threatening images. Based on the findings, GSL scores increased among blacks who held high levels of Linked Fate, while the GSL scores decreased among those who high levels of Racial Centrality. The coefficient for blacks who possessed high levels of Public Regard was marginally significant at the p < .10 level.

Table 2. Blacks' Responses to Threatening Images Linear regression

1		Robust				
					[95% Conf.	
+- Age					0008776	
Sex Male	.000755	.0078141	0.10	0.924	0150779	.0165879
Education	001421	.0018993	-0.75	0.459	0052694	.0024274
Linked Fate	.010117	.0032096	3.15	0.003	.0036136	.0166203
Society						
Unfair	0083712	.0051642	-1.62	0.114	0188349	.0020925
Legal Unfair	.0002267	.0042066	0.05	0.957	0082967	.0087501
Assimilation	.0000549	.0014327	0.04	0.970	002848	.0029577
Violent_						
Encounter	.0029621	.0033993	0.87	0.389	0039255	.0098498
Natinoal ID	.0005856	.0034074	0.17	0.864	0063185	.0074897
Police too Far	.006347	.0047486	1.34	0.190	0032746	.015968
Centrality	0026125	.0010942	-2.39	0.022	0048295	0003955
Public_Regard	.002179	.0011739	1.86	0.071	0001995	.0045575
Black_Nation	.0024306	.0025137	0.97	0.340	0026626	.0075238
Nebraska	.0016252	.0073675	0.22	0.827	0133028	.0165532
Ferguson	.0233341	.012907	1.81	0.079	0028179	.0494862
St Louis	0070109	.0204527	-0.34	0.734	048452	.0344301
Jackson2	0058294	.0119326	-0.49	0.628	0300072	.0183483
_cons	0067164	.0258691	-0.26	0.797	0591322	.0456994

N=55 $R^2=.39$

Conclusion

In this paper, we conceptualized adverse interactions between police and the minority communities they sometimes serve as racially traumatic stressful events (RTSEs) and sought to measure public responses to them. We measured galvanic skin levels while exposing the subjects to an array of photos, including photos of police conducting traffic stops. Further, we explored

African-American intra-racial differences, examining whether attitudinal predispositions, in particular previous experiences with violent encounters with law enforcement, various strands of black identity and controlling for traditional demographic variables. The findings revealed that African Americans who possessed high levels of Linked Fate, American Identity, Legal Disillusionment, Public Regard and who believed that the police went too far in Ferguson possessed higher responses when compared to those who scored lower on each of the scales. On the other hand, African Americans who possessed higher levels of Assimilation, Black Nationalism and those who believed that society as a whole is unfair to African Americans all responded less when compared to their counterparts. Those who had high levels of Racial Centrality scored lower, but, the coefficient was marginally significant ($p \approx .062$).

To assess whether images of Traffic Stops uniquely impact blacks' physiological responses, we exposed individuals to threatening images borrowed from the International Affective Picture Systems (IAPS) threatening photo series. The IAPS threat photos we used included an attacking dog, attacking snakes, and a man with a gun in his mouth, a masked man with a knife, and a street scene with shooting soldiers. Based on the findings, GSL scores increased among blacks who held high levels of Linked Fate, while the GSL scores decreased among those who high levels of Racial Centrality. The fact that mere photos of police conducting traffic stops generated responses similar to photos taken from the IAPS threatening photo series should be taken as a sign that these are important problems in need of more study.

Appendix Table 1. Traffic Stop Photos











Working Citations

- Allen, R. L., Dawson, M. C. & Brown, R. E. (1989). A Schema-Based Approach to Modeling an African-American Racial Belief System. American Political Science Review 83, 421-441.
- Block, Ray. What About Disillusionment? Exploring the Pathways to Black Nationalism. Political Behavior 33: 1 pp 27-51
- Boucsein, Wolfram, Don C. Fowles, Sverre Grimnes, Gershon Ben-Shakhar, Walton T. Roth, Michael E. Dawson, and Diane L. Filion. 2012. Publication recommendations for electrodermal measurements. *Psychophysiology* 49: 1017–1034
- Brown, Robert and Todd Shaw 2002; Brown, Robert and Todd C. Shaw, "Separate Nations: Two Attitudinal Dimensions of Black Nationalism." Journal of Politics. 64: 22-44.
- Burch, Traci. 2013. Trading Democracy for Justice. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Carter, R. T. (2007). Racism and psychological and emotional injury: Recognizing and assessing race-based traumatic stress. The <u>Counseling Psychologist</u>, 35(1), 13-105.
- Clark and Clark, 1947. Racial Identification and Preferences in Negro Children. In T. M. Newcomb & E.L. Hartley (Eds). Readings in Social Psychology (pp 169-1987). New York: Holt.
- Cohen, C. (1999). Boundaries of Blackness: AIDS and the Breakdown of Black Politics Chicago; University of Chicago Press.
- Cota and Dion, 1986; Salience of gender and sex composition of ad hoc groups: An experimental test of distinctiveness theory. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology. 50, 770-776.
- Davis and Brown 2002; Davis, Darren and Ronald Brown. 2002. "The Antipathy of Black Nationalism: Behavioral and Attitudinal Implications of an African American Ideology." *American Journal of Political Science* 46: 239-252.
- Dawson, Michael. 2001. Black Vision The Roots of Contemporary African American Political Ideologies. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- _____. 1994. *Behind the Mule: Race, Class, and African American Politics*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Dodd, Michael, Amanda Balzer, Carly Jacobs, Michael Grusczynszyki, Kevin Smith, and John Hibbing. 2012. The Left Rolls with the Good, The Right Confronts the Bad: Physiology and Cognition in Politics. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society*, 367: 640-649.
- Epp, Charles R., Steven Maynard-Moody, and Donald Haider-Markel. 2014. *Pulled Over: How Police Stops Define Race and Citizenship*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Glaser, John C. 2015. Suspect Race: Causes and Consequences of Racial Profiling. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Grabe, M. E. & Kamhawi, R. (2006). Hard wired for negative news? Gender differences in processing broadcast news. *Communication Research*, *33* (5) 346-369.
- Grabe, M. E., Lang, A., Zhou, S., & Bolls, P. 2000. Cognitive access to negatively arousing news: An experimental investigation of knowledge gap. *Communication Research*, 27, 3-26.
- Gurin, Patria; Shirley Hatchett; and James Jackson. 1989. <u>Hope and Independence: Blacks'</u>
 <u>Response to Electoral and Party Politics</u>. New York: Russel Sage Foundation.
- Gurin, Patricia and Edgar Epps. 1975. <u>Black Consciousness, Identity and Achievement.</u> New York: Wiley.
- Gurin, Patricia; Arthur H. Miller and Gerald Gurin. 1980. "Stratum Identification and Consciousness." *Social Psychology Quarterly* 43: 30-47.

- Hochschild, J. Facing up the American Dream. (1995). NJ, Princeton University Press.
- Holman, E. Alison, Dana Rose Garfin and Roxane Cohen Silver (2014) Media's role in broadcasting acute stress following the Boston Marathon bombings." 2014 Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America. Vol. 111 http://www.pnas.org/content/111/1/93
- Horowitz, R 1939. Racial aspects of self-dentification in nursery school children. Journal of Psychology. 7, 91-99.
- Horowitz, R1936; The development of attitude toward the Negro. Archives of Psychology, 104.
- Jost, John T., and Mahzarin R. Banaji. 1994. "The Role of Stereotyping in System-Justification and the Production of False Consciousness." *British Journal of Social Psychology* 33: 1-27.
- Kinder and Sanders 1996, Donald K. and Lynn M. Sanders. 1996. Divided by Color. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Lerman, Amy E., and Vesla M. Weaver. 2014. *Arresting Citizenship*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Lincoln, K. D., Chatters, L. M., Taylor, R. J., & Jackson, J. S. (2007). Profiles of depressive symptoms among African Americans and Caribbean Blacks. Social Science & Medicine, 65, 200–213.
- Maltby, Elizabeth. 2017. The Political Origins of Racial Inequality. *Political Research Quarterly* 70, 3: 535–548.
- Markus and Nurius, 1986; The self in social information processing. In J. Suls (Ed). Psychological perspectives on the self (Vol. 1, pp 41-70) Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.
- Martin, P., Wout, D., Nguyen, H. X., Gonzalez, R., & Sellers, R. M. (2010). Investigating the psychometric properties of the Multidimensional Inventory of Black Identity in two samples: The development of the MIBI-S. Unpublished manuscript.
- McCrae & Costa, 1988; Age, personality, and spontaneous self-concept. Journal of Gerontology, 46, 177-185.
- McGuire, W. J. & Padawer-Singer, A.1976. Trait salience in the spontaneous self-concept. . Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 33(6): 743-754.
- McGuire, W. J., McGuire, C. V., Child, P., & Fujioka, T. 1978. Salience of Ethnicity in the Spontaneous Self-Concept as a Function of One's Ethnic Distinctiveness in the Social Environment. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 36(5): 511-520.
- Meares, Tracey. 2009. The Legitimacy of Police among Young African-American Men. *Marquette Law Review* 92, 4: 651–666.
- Miller, Arthur, Patricia Gurin, Gerald Gurin and Oksana Malanchuk. 1981. "Group Consciousness and Political Participation." *American Journal of Political Science* 25: 494-511.
- Neblett, Enrique and Steven O. Roberts (2013) Racial identity and autonomic responses to racial discrimination." Psychophysiology,
- Orey, B. D. A., King, A. M., Lawrence, S. K., & Anderson, B. E. (2013). Black Opposition to Welfare in the Age of Obama. Race, Gender, and Class. 20(3/4), 114.
- Orey, B.D., Craemer, T., & Price, M. (2013). Using Black Samples to Conduct Implicit Racial Attitudes Research" *PS: Political Science and Politics*.
- Orey, B.D., King, A., Titani-Smith, L., and Ricks, B. (2012). "Black Opposition to Progressive Racial Policies and the "Double (Non)Consciousness" Thesis. Race and Policy 8: 52-66.

- Osmundsen, Mathias, David Hendry, Lasse Laustsen, Kevin Smith, John Hibbing, and Michael Bang Petersen. 2017. "Different Cultures, Same Foundations? A Cross-National Comparison of the Physiological and Psychological Foundations of Political Ideology." Paper Presented at the Annu- al Conference of the Midwest Political Science Association.
- Oxley, Douglas R., Kevin B. Smith, John Alford, Matthew V. Hibbing, Jennifer L. Miller, Mario Scalora, Peter K. Hatemi, & John R. Hibbing. 2008. "Political Attitudes Vary with Physiological Traits", *Science*, 321: 1667-1670.
- Oxley, Douglas R., Kevin B. Smith, John Alford, Matthew V. Hibbing, Jennifer L. Miller and Mario J. Scalora, Peter K. Hatemi, and John R. Hibbing. Political Attitudes Vary with Physiological Traits. 2008. Science 321:5896 pp 1667–1670
- Reese and Brown 1995), Reese, Laura A. and Ronald E. Brown. 1995. "The Effects of Religious Messages." *Journal of Politics* 57: 24-43.
- Seery, Holman, and Silver 2010) Whatever Does Not Kill Us: Cumulative Lifetime Adversity, Vulnerability, and Resilience Journal of Personality and Social Psychology American Psychological Association 2010, Vol. 99, No. 6, 1025–104
- Sellers Robert M. Mia A. Smith, J. Nicole Shelton, Stephanie A. J. Rowley and Tabbye M. Chavous. 1998. Multidimensional Model of Racial Identity: A Reconceptualization of African American Racial Identity." Personality and Social Psychology Review Vol. 1, No. 1, 18-39. (1998)
- Shingles 1981; Shingles, Richard. 1981. "Black Consciousness and Political Participation: The Missing Link." *American Political Science Review* 75: 76-91.
- Smith, Kevin B., Douglas Oxley, Matthew V. Hibbing, John R. Alford, and John R. Hibbing. 2011. Disgust sensitivity and the neurophysiology of left-right political orientations. *PloS one* 6: e25552.
- Smith, W. A., Hung, M., Franklin, J. D. (2011). Racial Battle Fatigue and the Miseducation of Black Men: Microaggressions, Societal Problems, & Environmental Stress. Journal of Negro Education.
- Sniderman, Paul M., and Thomas Piazza. 2002. Black Pride and Black Prejudice. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Soroka, Stuart and Stephen McAdams. 2015. News, Politics and Negativity. *Political Communication* 32: 1-22.
- Soroka, Stuart, Elisabeth Gidengil, Patrick Fournier, and Lilach Nir. 2016. Do Women and Men Respond Differently to Negative News? *Politics and Gender* 12 (2): 344-368.
- Soroka, Stuart, Patrick Fournier and Lilach Nir. 2017. A Cross-National, Psychophysiological Study of the Connection between Negativity Biases and Political Preferences. Presented at the Ninth Annual NYU CESS Experimental Political Science Conference, New York, February.
- Soto Dawson-Andoh and BeLue 2011; The relationship between perceived discrimination and Generalized Anxiety Disorder among African Americans, Afro Caribbeans, and non-Hispanic Whites. J Anxiety Disord. 2011 Mar;25(2):258-65.
- Tate 1993. From Protest to Politics: The New Black Voters in American Politics. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Tyler, Tom R., Jeffrey Fagan, and Amanda Geller. 2014. Street Stops and Police Legitimacy: Teachable Moments in Young Urban Men's Legal Socialization. *Journal of Empirical Legal Studies* 11, 4: 751–785.

Voigt, Rob, Nicholas P. Camp, Vinodkumar Prabhakaran, William L. Hamilton, Rebecca C. Hetey, Camilla M. Griffiths, David Jurgens, Dan Jurafsky, and Jennifer L. Eberhardt. 2017. Language from police body camera footage shows racial disparities in officer respect. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science (PNAS)* www.pnas.org/cgi/doi/10.1073/pnas.1702413114

Welch et al 2002;?

Welch, Susan, Lee Sigelman, Timothy Bledsoe and Michael Combs. 2001. <u>Race and Place</u>. Cambridge University Press.

Williams, Monica. The Link Between Racism and PTSD. 2015 https://www.psychologytoday.com/blog/culturally-speaking/201509/the-link-between-racism-and-ptsd